Foreword

When we reflect on the crisis of faith in the Catholic Church, our heart cannot but ache for its countless victims, both lay and clerical. The victims who most readily come to mind are those of the “left.” Through unwitting obedience to recent Popes, these now profess and practice a faith unrecognizable to our forefathers. Nevertheless, even if smaller in number, those of the “right” must not be overlooked. So scandalized by the deviations of recent Popes, these overreact by denying the papacy to such men. Left or right, both extremes result from the same error—an exaggerated notion of papal infallibility. Charity demands that we show both factions the errors and the dangers in their respective paths.

Concerning the left, the history of our Society bears witness to our constant effort to do just that. But until now—at least in the English-speaking world—only articles and booklets have been published against Sedevacantism and its related errors. A comprehensive and definitive refutation, firmly grounded in ecclesiology, has been sorely needed. We thus pray that True or False Pope? finds its way to many Catholics of good will, be they of perplexed mind at the moment. Mr. Salza and Mr. Siscoe’s book will surely afford much clarity to the reader, but the underlying mystery will remain: today’s crisis touches a mystery that can be confronted only by faith—the mystery of divine suffering.

As Pope Pius XII defined Her, the Catholic Church is the Mystical Body of Christ. At present She is re-living His Passion. Let us take the Blessed Virgin Mary, who stood faithful by her Son’s Cross to the very end, as our model of fidelity. The Mother knew her Son to be God Almighty, but knew Him also to be the suffering servant. The suffering was real and not a fantasy as the Docetists taught. These ancient heretics renounced the Incarnation and the Humanity of Christ because of the scandal of the Cross. In like manner the Sedevacantists, succumbing to this same temptation, deny that the visible Church, during Her Passion, remains divine. Let us reassert our belief in the mystery of Her divine and human reality. The Catholic Church is One, Holy, Catholic, and Apostolic, yet composed of fragile members. She is founded on St. Peter and the gates of hell will not prevail against Her.

Our venerable founder, a true son of the Church, suffered very acutely at the sight of his Mother in such a pitiable state. The victims of Sedevacantism who failed to accept this great mystery of the divine suffering augmented his own. Yet, in spite of his suffering, even at the
hands of the men of the Church, he refused to abandon Her during Her Passion. It was in this spirit of fidelity that he had founded the Society; it is this spirit that we strive to keep. May Mary, the Mother of Christ and the Church, lead us through the narrow gate and the strait way that leads to life, erring neither to the left nor to the right.

+ Bernard Fellay

Superior General of the Society of Saint Pius X

Feast of All Saints, November 1, 2015